

Jury meeting 2nd Ladies WFFC

Date / time : 27 Sep 2023 at 19.30

Present : as foreseen in the captains meeting jury selection

Subject : protest by USA ladies Captain Glade Hunter regarding fishing adjacent beats while mathematically possible not to do so.

Text of protest :

Quote

To those concerned

As I believe you are aware there is concern with the draw on the Similkameen river for the ladies championship. The requirement per rule 22.2 is as follows: The random draw is designed to ensure that anglers from the same team will not fish any beat in any sector more than once, nor, if mathematically possible, an adjacent beat (with exception of sub sessions).

After the draw was released today for the river it was observed that there are teams that have been assigned to beats that were fished by other anglers in their team the previous day. Specifically it looks like 3 teams were fishing the same beats today. This is due to the rotation of beats.

I have inspected the masters draw and do not see this problem yet, but it is a statistical probability that it will happen there as well.

Based on my reading of the rule the draw does not follow the requirement and as such it should have been redrawn until it meets the requirement. This is in fact mathematically possible. There are 5 sessions and 10 teams. Each team by definition of this requirement should fish each beat set. This would have presented the most fair distribution of beats and over the course of 5 sessions each team would have been able to represent themselves fairly on this sector.

I am formally protesting the draw for Tuesday September 26 and failure to follow the rule 22.2. I have been in contact with many team captains and managers whom all agree that there needs to be a solution put in place to ensure correction for draws for the remainder of the week as well as address the results for today.

I will also propose a resolution to this issue.

First, the draw should be inspected for both the ladies and masters and manually corrected to ensure that beats are not fished by the same team twice.

Second, for today's results, there are two ways to resolve it. In a situation in the USA where we have some experience in the past. In the USA we have conducted 4 session competitions where we have had a weather event on the final day that prohibited us from fishing the final session. We convened a jury and made the decision that the entire sector would be removed from the competition. The result was that only 3 sessions were used to calculate the final results, we removed the sector that was impacted from all final results. This was the only way to ensure that each individual and team is fairly represented during the event. An alternate solution would be to average all scores for today and give each anglers an average score (5). I believe that these are the only fair types of solutions that can be implemented.

I invite your acknowledgment of this email at your earliest opportunity and any feedback that you may have to promote a fair competitive experience for all individuals and nations that are representing themselves here in Kamloops.

Please advise me as to the correct way to make the required payment. I will find one of you at dinner this evening.

Best regards

Glade Gunther

Captain of the USA senior and ladies world and national teams

unquote

Glade Hunter, together with the IO, convened a meeting with the captains of the ladies teams to discuss the issue and to make proposals for the rest of the competition.

Result of this meeting :

- Session 1 : unanimous agreement no problem with the result as it is
- Session 4-5 : unanimous agreement that the draw should be revised to ensure that no beats are fished by the same team
- Session 2-3 : there was no unanimous agreement on 3 possibilities
 - #1 : leave result as it is , received least support
 - #2 : give every angler 5 placing points and equivalent fish points , received marginal support
 - #3 : reduce the maximum amount of points for a blank to 5 points in order to minimize the impact to affected anglers without punishing the angler that performed well . This proposal received most support

Comments by FIPS-Mouche :

The draw program does not provide a random draw solution for 10 teams without the use of adjacent beats. A computer program generates a random sequence by a certain algorithm, as such the result is never completely random.

The draw as produced by the computer is correct with regards to allocated beats for the first half of the session. The fishing of same beats is a result of the fact that rotations are being used for this competition.

Board members acknowledge that there are draw combinations possible without having adjacent beats, in this case however the result is not random as in the last session the competitors would know which beat they will be fishing. This the reason why the draw program could not produce a valid draw without adjacent beats.

We acknowledge that it is not nice for the competitors to have to fish the same beats as their teammates. We are willing to adapt manually the draw for the last 2 sessions .

Glade Hunter, also a member of the jury, was asked to leave the room and not participate in the discussion as he is the complaining party.

Jury discussion

The draw program produced a valid draw result with the set parameters.

Proposed solution #2 is not really an option as this comes down to cancelling out the session. The rules state that we must have 5 scoring sessions for a valid competition.

Proposed solution #3 is only partially possible within the program. The possible penalty should be only 1 place point more than the angler with the least amount of fish caught. The jury finds this to be an insufficient penalty for a blank score.

Jury decision

- The complaint by USA team captain is a valid complaint. He will receive his 220 USD in return.
- For the sake of optimal fishing opportunities for the remaining of the championship the draw for session 4 and 5 will be adapted manually to ensure that all teams fish beats the teammates have not fished before.
- The score from session 1 , 2 and 3 will remain unchanged.

The captain of the USA Ladies team was called back into the room and informed about the decision. He received 220 USD in return.

Meeting closed at 20:15 hrs.